

# Lecture 9 Handout

Alexander Arnold  
University of Notre Dame  
aarnold1@nd.edu

24 September 2009

**Argument A:** The Pairing Argument

**A1:** Event  $E$  causes event  $C$  only if  $E$  and  $C$  are paired.

**A2:** The only way for two events to be paired is to be located in space-time.

**A3:** Therefore,  $E$  causes  $C$  only if  $E$  and  $C$  are located in space-time. (from A1, A2)

**A4:** If Substance Dualism is true, no mental event is located in space-time.

**A5:** Therefore, if Substance Dualism is true, then no mental event causes a physical event. (from A3, A4)

**A7:** *But*, mental events sometimes do cause physical events.

**A8:** Therefore, Substance Dualism is false.

**Pairing:** Suppose Gun 1 and Gun 2 fire at the same time,  $t_1$ ; let their different firings be events  $G_1$  and  $G_2$ . Suppose at  $t_2$ , Tom and Harry die of gunshot wounds. Let these events be, respectively,  $C$  and  $D$ . Question: how do we figure out which firing killed which person? Answer: by figuring out the spatial relationships between the different events.