

Lecture 8 Handout

Alexander Arnold
University of Notre Dame
aarnold1@nd.edu

22 September 2009

Some definitions

physical thing: a thing is physical iff it has all and only physical parts

nonphysical thing: a thing is nonphysical iff it isn't physical

concrete thing: a thing is concrete iff it can do something

abstract thing: a thing is abstract iff it isn't concrete

substance: a thing is a substance iff its existence is independent of anything else

Argument A Modal Argument, first pass

A1: If I have a vivid and clear thought of something, then God can make something corresponding to that thought.

A2: I have a vivid and clear thought of myself existing without any body.

A3: Therefore, God can make me exist without any body.

A4: If God can make me exist without any body, then I am not a body.

A5: Therefore, my mind is not a body.

Argument B Modal Argument, second pass

B1: I have the property of possibly existing without any body existing.

B2: No body has the property of possibly existing without any body existing.

B3: If $x=y$, then x has characteristic F iff y has F

B4: Therefore, I am not a body.

Argument C The Thinking Thing Argument

C1: I am a thinking thing.

C2: No body can think.

C3: Therefore, I am not a body.

The Divisibility Argument

D1: All bodies are divisible.

D2: No mind is divisible.

D3: Therefore, no mind is a body.

D4: I am my mind.

D5: Therefore, I am not a body.