

Mary's First Three Problems With Substance Dualism
from Mind and Brain: A Dialogue on the Mind-Body Problem

"First Night"

The We Evolved From Material Minds Argument

- (1) Animal minds are material.
- (2) We evolved from animals.
- (3) If animal minds are material and we evolved from animals, then it is likely that our minds are material.
- (4) Therefore, It is likely that our minds are material.

The Complete Psychology Argument

- (1) Materialism would make a complete scientific explanation of the mind possible.
- (2) Immaterialism would make a complete scientific explanation of the mind impossible.
- (3) If (between two theories) A makes a complete scientific explanation possible and B does not, then AND there are no other reasons to favor B over A, then we should believe A over B.
- (4) There are no other reasons to believe Substance Dualism over Materialism.
- (5) Therefore, we should believe Materialism (over Substance Dualism).

The Argument From Simplicity

- (1) Dualism does not explain more than materialism and it posits extra stuff.
- (2) If theory A does not explain more than theory B and A posits more stuff than B, then we should not believe A over B.
- (3) Therefore, we shouldn't believe dualism over materialism.