

## Cartesian-esque Arguments for Substance Dualism

### The Thinking Thing Argument

- (1) I am a thinking thing.
- (2) My body is not a thinking thing.
- (3) Therefore, I am not my body.

Response: Part of my body *is* a thinking thing. My brain.

- If by 'body' we include our brain, then premise (2) is false.
- If by 'body' we mean everything, but our brain, then (2) might be true. However, the conclusion won't support substance dualism

### The Divisibility Argument

- (1) My mind is indivisible.
- (2) My brain is divisible.
- (3) Therefore, my mind is distinct from my brain.

Response: There is some evidence to suggest that the mind *is* divisible. We can remove memories *by removing parts of the brain*. Commissurotomy cases. Cases where persons seem to develop split personalities. Premise (1) is very questionable.

### 3 Versions of the Argument from Introspection

Pick any mental state M and any brain state B that M might be identical to. For example.

M = phenomenal sensation of redness  
B = C-fiber firing

If the following arguments are sound, then we can run similar arguments for any mental state/brain state pair.

### What Little Andy Knows

- (1) Little Andy knows about M.
- (2) Little Andy does not know about B.
- (3) If (1) and (2), then M has a property that B does not have
- (4) If M has a property that B does not have, then M and B are not identical.
- (5) Therefore, M and B are not identical.

### The Imagining Argument

- (1) I can imagine mental state M existing independently of brain state B.
- (2) I cannot imagine brain state B existing independently of brain state B.
- (3) If (1) and (2), then M has a property that B does not have
- (4) If M has a property that B does not have, then M and B are not identical.
- (5) Therefore, M and B are not identical.

### The Doubting Argument

- (1) I can doubt that I am in brain state B.
- (2) I cannot doubt that I am in mental state M.
- (3) If (1) and (2), then M has a property that B does not have
- (4) If M has a property that B does not have, then M and B are not identical.
- (5) Therefore, M and B are not identical.